

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT

Kelly L. Stephens  
Clerk

100 EAST FIFTH STREET, ROOM 540  
POTTER STEWART U.S. COURTHOUSE  
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-3988

Tel. (513) 564-7000  
[www.ca6.uscourts.gov](http://www.ca6.uscourts.gov)

Filed: October 15, 2024

Ms. Ann E. Filkins  
U.S. District Court  
for the Western District of Michigan at Grand Rapids  
110 Michigan Street, N.W.  
Suite 399 Federal Building  
Grand Rapids, MI 49503-0000

Re: Case No. 23-1954, *Daretha Braziel, et al v. Gretchen Whitmer, et al*  
Originating Case No. 1:21-cv-00960

Dear Ms. Filkins,

Enclosed is a copy of the mandate filed in this case.

Sincerely,

s/Abby Hahn  
for Jill Colyer, Case Management Specialist

cc: Mr. Mark P. Chalos  
Mr. Carl Ray Edwards  
Ms. Alice B. Jennings  
Ms. Alexandra Markel  
Ms. Annika K. Martin  
Mr. Walter George Pelton  
Mr. Thomas J. Rheume Jr.

Enclosure

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT**

---

No: 23-1954

---

Filed: October 15, 2024

DARETHA BRAZIEL, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan, next friend of RB, next friend of DB, next friend of DR; KEESHA JONES, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan, next friend of KJ, next friend of DJ, next friend of TC, next friend of KB; IEASHA JONES, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan; MICHAEL D. BRIGHAM, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan; REBECCA BRANSCUMB, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan; STACEY BRANSCUMB, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan; EMMA KINNARD, individually and on behalf of themselves and all other similarly situated Plaintiff Residents of the City of Benton Harbor, Michigan

Plaintiffs - Appellees

v.

GRETCHEN WHITMER, Governor, individually and in her official capacity; STATE OF MICHIGAN, Environment, Great Lakes & Energy; LIESL CLARK, Director, individually and in her official capacity; ERIC OSWALD, Drinking Water Unit Director, individually and in his official capacity; MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES; ROBERT GORDON, Director, in his individual and official capacity; ELIZABETH HERTEL, Director, in her individual and official capacity; DARWIN WATSON, City Manager, individually and in his official capacity; ELLIS MITCHELL, City Manager, individually and in his official capacity; BENTON HARBOR WATER DEPARTMENT; ELHORN ENGINEERING COMPANY; F&V OPERATIONS AND RESOURCE MANAGEMENT, INC.

Defendants

and

MARCUS MUHAMMAD, Mayor, individually and in his official capacity; MICHAEL O'MALLEY, Water Plant Operator, individually and in his official capacity; CITY OF BENTON HARBOR, MI, a Municipal Corporation, through the Benton Harbor Water Department

Defendants - Appellants

MANDATE

Pursuant to the court's disposition that was filed 08/28/2024 the mandate for this case hereby issues today.

COSTS: None